

**From:** JP Booyens <jpbooyens@ccholdings.co.za>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 06 August 2024 2:01 PM  
**To:** ferdi@idss.co.za  
**Subject:** FW: Final Resolution Land Rover Discovery 4 3.0D (2013)  
**Attachments:** ATT1.PDF; ATT2.PDF; ATT3.PDF; ATT4.PDF; ATT5.PDF; ATT6.PDF; ATT7.PDF

Good day, Mr. F. Marallich,

Please find below the findings of your complaint.

On 2024/07/20, you brought your vehicle into the Car Service City George branch for the work detailed in the attached invoice (Att1.PDF). The odometer reading was 198,200 km.

Services performed:

- Major Service
- Oil 5W30 Fully synthetic, Low ash
- Oil Filter
- Air Filter
- Diesel Filter

It was noted that the vehicle had **not been serviced for nearly 25,000 km** and that the **oil was like syrup**, as stated by the technician to DEKRA, though this was not noted on the CSC paperwork. (ATT3.PDF)

Identified but not authorized work:

- Brake Pads Front & Rear 20%
- Pipes and wires in the engine compartment were chewed by mice/rats (Noted on Invoice 5310601).

Footage of the broken pipe and wires was presented, indicating pre-existing damage. It was asked if the branch could help fix some of the wires to keep the vehicle running. The branch assisted free of charge, but unfortunately, due to the extent of the damaged wires from the rats, it was only a temporary fix.

After the service and temporary repairs to the chewed-off wires and pipe were completed, the vehicle was collected on the same day (2024/07/20). When the client came to collect the vehicle, it was noted that the vehicle was pushing a mass amount of white smoke out of the exhaust pipe. Both parties reported that the vehicle's engine then started "running away" until the engine stopped.

The vehicle was then moved into the workshop, where the oil was drained and measured in the presence of the client, totalling 6.5 liters of oil.

CSC George decided to keep the vehicle for further investigation and inspection. A loan vehicle was requested and provided even though this is not the normal protocol for the business but was done out of goodwill.

The branch was accused that the work done on the vehicle (i.e., a straight service) was the cause of the engine runaway, so it was decided to bring an independent party, DEKRA, to assess the situation.

On 2024/07/24, an independent DEKRA Assessor assessed the vehicle at CSC George. The following was inspected and noted by the independent DEKRA Assessor (ATT2)(CAW120440.PDF). Please see the Details of Failure on the DEKRA Report.

Important points to note:

- The assessor reported that the left-side turbo had a crack in it and the oil seals had failed, indicating a pre-existing condition as per DEKRA (ATT6.PDF) (DEKRA Report, Picture Turbo L/Side).

DEKRA Conclusion Report 1:

- The failure is not considered to be related to the previous repair of the wiring and/or the standard service that was carried out.

On 2024/08/02, DEKRA conducted another inspection on the vehicle, this time running a diagnostic report, which was not possible during the previous inspection as the vehicle body was lifted from the chassis. The diagnostic reported the following (ATT5.PDF) (Assessment Conducted by DEKRA George Branch Manager).

Based on both DEKRA inspections, it was made clear that the “runaway” engine was not caused by the work carried out by CSC George but by pre-existing conditions on the vehicle.

**On 2024/08/02, an independent DEKRA Assessor assessed the vehicle at CSC George. The following was inspected and noted by the independent DEKRA Assessor (ATT2)(CAW120440.PDF):**

- (P1247-00) Turbocharger boost pressure low. (Historic) (Pre-existing Issue)
- (P0235-94) Turbocharger/Supercharger boost sensor A circuit. (Historic) (Pre-existing Issue)
- (P0033-00) Turbocharger/Supercharger bypass valve control – Circuit open. (Intermittent)

**The following was noted by DEKRA as details of Failure (ATT6.PDF):**

- Oil contamination in the intercooler pipe.
- Vacuum pipe and wiring repair were observed (Picture was taken prior to repairs) (Presented by the client) Picture clearly indicates gnaw marks on the vacuum pipe; one wire was completely chewed through. The vacuum pipe was completely chewed through.
- Chewed-off wires connect to the primary turbocharger’s solenoid valve.
- During the first inspection, it was observed that the primary turbocharger had a crack in the housing.
- Excessive oil contamination from the turbocharger into the intercooler pipe.

**DEKRA Assessor's Remarks and Conclusions:**

- Diagnostic fault codes listed indicate a history of turbocharger failure.
- **Damaged turbocharger solenoid wire resulted in the turbocharger solenoid valve not operating to manufacturer’s specification.** An incorrectly functioning solenoid valve results in an incorrectly operating turbocharger, leading to misfiring, overheating, and uneven wear and damages to engine and turbocharger components.

- It cannot be ruled out that the described damage of the turbocharger was caused by the damaged wiring and the respective malfunction of the solenoid valve.
- After the repair of the wiring, the solenoid valve was operating, and the turbocharger was functioning to the manufacturer's specification. However, with the damage already sustained to the turbocharger, engine oil can enter the intake system of the engine, resulting in engine oil entering the combustion chambers and causing the “runaway” engine.

Based on both DEKRA inspections, it was made clear that the “runaway” engine was not caused by the work carried out by CSC George but by pre-existing conditions on the vehicle. Therefore, CSC George cannot be held liable for the damage to the vehicle’s engine.

It is hereby requested that the Land Rover Discovery (Reg: CAW 120440) be removed from CSC George’s property within 3 business days before storage fees will be charged at R200 per day excl. VAT. Kindly also note that CSC George cannot be held liable for any damages that may occur to the vehicle whilst in storage.

A loan vehicle was kindly provided which was supposed to be returned on 2024/07/30. Unfortunately, you did not bring the rental car back when requested, and therefore the rental company has charged additional fees amounting to R9722.03, which will need to be settled by yourself. (ATT7.PDF)

Furthermore, should you not be satisfied with our findings, you are also free to escalate the complaint to MIOSA for further investigation. [MIOSA Complaint Online](#).

Kind regards,

